01/11/2008 09:37 2156405532 ACE PAGE 02/03

Į MARLENE S. MURACO, Bar No. 154240 mmuraco@littler.com 2 LITTLER MENDELSON A Professional Corporation 50 West San Fernando Street 3 15th Floor 4 San Jose, CA 95113.2303 Telephone: 408.998.4150 5 Attorneys for Defendants ESIS, INC., ACE AMERICAN INSURANCE 6 COMPANY 7 8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 9 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 10 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION 11 MARIA ABRAHIM. Case No. C07-4014 JCS 12 Plaintiff. DECLARATION OF DENISE CAF: ON IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT ESIS NC. 13 ٧. AND ACE AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY'S REPLY TO PLAIN I FF'S 14 ESIS, INC., ACE AMERICAN OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO COMPEL INSURANCE COMPANY, ARBITRATION 15 Defendants 16 Date: February 1, 2008 Time: 9:30 a.m. 17 Judge: Judge Joseph Spero Dept: Courtroom A, 15th Floor 18 19 20 21 I, DENISE CARSON, declare: 22 I submitted a declaration in support of Defendants' motior to compel 1. arbitration of Plaintiff Maria Abrahim's claims in this matter. 23 24 2. It has come to my attention that Plaintiff has objected to my decla: tion on the ground that it did not expressly state that I had personal knowledge of the matters discus: ( I therein. 25 26 I thought the existence of my personal knowledge was made clear ly virtue of the fact that the matters I addressed were obviously within the scope of my job respon: bilities as 27 Assistant Vice-President and then Vice-President of Human Resources for ACE (and, 1) forc that, 28 (CASE NO. C07-4014 JCS)

Director of Employee Relations for CIGNA) and by the fact that my declaration, it some cases, 1 addressed actions I had personally taken. However, in order to ensure there is no confusion, I am 2 3 certifying that I do, in fact, have personal knowledge of all the facts, circumstan: s and events described in the "DECLARATION OF DENISE CARSON IN SUPPORT OF I FENDANTS 4 5 ESIS, INC., AND ACE AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY'S MOTION 10 COMPEL ARBITRATION," which was filed with the Court on December 14, 2007. б 7 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United Dates that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and that this Declaration we executed on 8 9 January 11, 2008, at Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. 10 11 12 13 Firmwide:84018784.1 035894.1044 14 15 16 17

28
LITTI, ER MENDELBON
A PROFESSIONER OCHERSTON
19th Fahr,
58h John, CA \$41323244

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

(CASE NO. C07-4014 JCS)

2. DEC OF DENISE CARSON ISO REPLY 1 3 PLTF'S OPP TO MOTION TO COMPEL ARB.